

## Are South African print newspaper narratives reframed for Internet news portals or not?

---

Ilse Feinauer

Department of Afrikaans and Dutch, Stellenbosch University, South Africa  
E-mail: aef@sun.ac.za

### Abstract

This paper deals with the translation of newspaper texts from Afrikaans/English newspapers for Afrikaans/English Internet news portals. In this paper I discuss to what extent newspaper reports, selected for translation and subsequent publication on the Internet, undergo a reframing process and how these reports are edited, rewritten, reshaped and repackaged (transformed) for a new cultural context (Bielsa and Bassnett 2009). This study has a sociological and cultural perspective in that it deals with Baker's (2006) narrative frame model in detecting which narrative frames can be identified in the translation of these texts from South African newspapers for a more global readership. Baker sees framing as an active strategy that implies agency through which translators consciously participate in the construction of reality within a specific socio-cultural group. The way in which and the reasons why the news teams for the Internet news portals (re)direct or reframe the perspective of reality as constituted within South African print newspapers is the main research topic.

**Keywords:** news translation, transediting, narrative frame model, print newspapers, e-news platforms, ideology

### 1. Introduction

This paper deals with the transcreation, or rather transediting, of news texts from print newspapers for News24 and *Nuus24/Netwerk24*, respectively English and Afrikaans multilevel digital platforms. News24 was established 12 years ago as the main Internet news platform for Media24, which is a division of Naspers, one of the oldest South African Afrikaans- and Afrikaner-oriented publishers of magazines and newspapers. The Afrikaans Internet news portal *Nuus24* was established in September 2010 and replaced by *Netwerk24* in July 2013. In this paper I investigate the extent to which print news reports, selected for translation and subsequent publication on the Internet, undergo a reframing process. I also investigate how these reports are edited, rewritten, reshaped and repackaged (transformed) into a new context (Bielsa and Bassnett 2009:11).

This study has a sociological perspective in that it deals with Baker's (2006) narrative frame model. Its aim is to detect which narrative frames can be identified in the translation and adaptation of texts from a print newspaper genre to an Internet genre for a more global readership, or at least for a more technologically-advanced South African readership. Narrative theory and framing are used to investigate the ways in which translators highlight, weaken or transform aspects of the narrative(s) encoded in the source text (ST). Baker (2006:106) sees (re)framing as an active strategy that implies agency through which (in this case specifically) editors consciously participate in the construction of reality. Gambier (2006) suggests that media frames focus on what is discussed and how it is (or is not) discussed. According to Tymoczko (2007), translators (read 'editors') can be effective activists and empowered agents of social change.

This article can be read alongside two publications, Van Rooyen and Naudé (2009) and Van Rooyen (2011). In these publications the authors investigate the transediting processes taking place in adjusting texts by the South African Press Association (SAPA) for the news bulletins of OFM News (Van Rooyen and Naudé 2009), and describe the functioning of translation in the radio newsroom of *Radio Sonder Grense* (RSG), the Afrikaans service of the South African Broadcasting Corporation (SABC) (Van Rooyen 2011). In both these articles the authors illustrate how Nord's functionalist model, and more specifically her looping model, can be used to mediate in a multicultural newsroom. In this article, the way in which the news teams of News24 and *Nuus24/Netwerk24* (re)direct the perspective of reality as constituted within Afrikaans and English print newspapers is the main research topic. It links more closely to a paper by Chen (2009) in which he investigates the construction of 'self' and 'other' in the transediting of news texts concerning political conflicts.

## **2. Contextualisation of the newspaper group**

Naspers – short for *Nasionale Pers* ('National Press') – has grown from an organisation founded in 1915 with the primary goal of publishing the newspaper *De Burger*, a local Western Cape daily newspaper. Other newspapers followed suit, and magazine and book-publishing operations were founded. Naspers's print-media operations have developed over the years to such an extent that Naspers is now one of the leading media groups in Africa. With the advent of electronic media, Naspers expanded its activities in the 1980s to incorporate pay-television and, later, Internet platforms. By 1990 its products covered the whole of South Africa, with newspapers, magazines and books in most of the 11 official languages. In 2000 Naspers organised and branded its print media businesses under the Media24 umbrella, and to simplify its group structure, Naspers consolidated all of its print media, book publishing and private education under Media24 in 2005 (History and Development 2010).

The daily newspapers *Die Burger*, *Beeld* and *Volksblad* have remained Afrikaans, but these days they are not so much focussed on white and Afrikaner readers. They have adapted fairly seamlessly to the new South Africa, with the newspapers now assuming the role of watchdog for minority groups and being some of the main critics of the ANC regime. They have indeed come a long way since 1948, when *Die Burger* started playing the role of "spokes newspaper" for the then-governing National Party and its infamous policy of apartheid. From the 1980s onwards and during the 1990s in particular, these ties were gradually severed, and Naspers and its publications started committing themselves to a new national unit encompassing all the people of South Africa.

The English newspapers used as STs are *City Press* and *The Witness*. First published in 1982 as *Golden City Press*, *City Press* is a Sunday newspaper aimed at black readers. Its name was changed in 1983, and Media24 acquired the paper in 1984. South Africa's oldest newspaper, *The Witness*, serves English readers throughout KwaZulu-Natal, with most of its readers in inland KwaZulu-Natal. Owned by Media24, it was formerly known as the *Natal Witness*. These newspapers were chosen intentionally because they belong to Media24. By only selecting offshoots of Media24, no variation in company ideology is introduced, even though different publications are investigated as STs (medioclubsouthafrica 2011).

The players investigated here within this social field of media discourse are the editorial teams and journalists of the original Afrikaans and English newspapers, the editorial teams and transeditors of News24 and *Nuus24/Netwerk24*, as well as the readerships of both the source and target news texts. Data were collected from all these sources. Source text readers of the Afrikaans newspapers are primarily Afrikaans-speaking and reside in metropolitan areas. They include mostly white and some coloured male and female South Africans from a middle to higher socio-economic class, in the age group 35 and older. The daily readership of the biggest Afrikaans print paper, *Die Burger*, is 550 000, which adds up to 3.3 million a week (Average issue readership of newspapers and magazines profile 2009). Source text readers of the biggest English newspaper used here, *City Press*, are primarily English-speaking and reside in metropolitan areas. They are mostly black females from a middle to higher socio-economic class, in the age group 25 and older. The readership for this Sunday newspaper amounts to 1 867 000 a week.

The target text (TT) readership for News24 is primarily local South African readers who access their news electronically, South Africans travelling locally and internationally, as well as expatriates. They are from a higher socio-economic class and mostly white metropolitan English- and Afrikaans-speakers (Internet users, international travellers, highly schooled and skilled), in the age group 30 and older. To a lesser extent, News24 is also read by an international readership with special interest in South Africa. Daily readership figures are 200,000. During March 2010, for instance, 2.4 million people, of which 1.7 million were local, accessed the site (Momberg 2010).

The TT readership for *Nuus24/Netwerk24* is primarily (90%) local Afrikaans South African readers who access their news electronically, Afrikaans South Africans travelling locally and internationally, as well as Afrikaans expatriates. They are from a higher socio-economic class and are mostly white, male, metropolitan Afrikaans-speakers (Internet users, international travellers, highly schooled and skilled), in the age group 30 and older. Monthly readership figures are 360,000 – more or less 12,000 a day (Oldewage 2011). Keep in mind that Nuus24 was only launched in September 2009.

### 3. Theoretical base

According to Johnson and Ensslin (2007:13), “in their function as public agencies of observation, interpretation, performance, representation and dissemination, the media exhibit a variety of signifying practices, which are unconditionally purpose-driven. Depending upon their particular point of emphasis, media producers therefore combine ‘conative’, ‘emotive’ and ‘conceptual’ meanings so as to achieve a maximum effect on the target audience”. This can be linked to Fox (2009), who claims that so-called “objective reality” is superseded by a

constructed reality unique to the paper and its readers. A process of constant recall of ‘common knowledge’ (knowledge shared only by the newspaper and its readers) leads readers to assume as factual knowledge what is in fact the discursive end established by the newspaper. Since news organisations are socially, culturally and politically situated, the so-called “suitable” and “acceptable” texts published in any newspaper, whether translated from a news agency or sourced and written as original texts by local journalists, are by no means completely neutral accounts of facts, but rather constitute a reality that has been constructed from the favoured perspectives of the news organisation.

This constructed reality is presented in the form of a narrative which is usually framed in a specific way. According to Baker (2006), human knowledge is narrative in nature and is therefore inclined to represent a particular perspective. There is no neutral ground, no neutral knowledge and consequently no neutral translation. Every translation is in one way or another a re-narration and a re-telling of the source text. Journalists and media translators can resort to various strategies to strengthen or undermine specific aspects of the narratives they mediate. Baker (2006:106) defines framing as “an *active strategy* that implies agency and by means of which we consciously participate in the construction of reality” (own emphasis). This means that the same set of events can be framed in different ways to promote competing or even complementary narratives. Baker (2006:107) refers to this as *frame ambiguity*, and this is what is investigated in this article. There is always a decision that needs to be taken on how the report on what is said or written should be interpreted and (re)presented, while the agents remain fully aware of the fact that these narratives would have specific effects on the diverse parties. We must remember that, just like some discourses are defined by the commentary on them, journalism is also a form of commentary. This commentary can be adjusted according to the ideological frames of newspapers by, for instance, omitting, adding or giving more relevance to some parts.

Baker’s (2006, 2007) literature was developed as part of the sociological turn in Translation Studies. She investigates the ways in which translators and interpreters emphasise, undercut or modify narrative aspects in STs. Different framing strategies are used in the transcreation process, and by doing this, the transediting team takes part in the reconstruction of sociological and ideological reality. According to Baker (2006:3), narrative theory “[r]ecognizes that people’s behaviour is ultimately guided by the stories they come to believe about the events in which they are embedded, rather than by their gender, race, colour of skin, or any other attribute”. Narrative is defined by the “[p]ublic and personal stories we tell ourselves, not just those we explicitly tell other people, about the world(s) in which we live” (Baker 2006:19).

Baker’s (2006, 2007:151) model of analysis mainly relies on the concept of narrative as seen within the fields of social and communication theory, rather than narratology or linguistics. “Narratives” are defined as ‘public and personal stories’ that present and construct our perceptions of the world (see also Fisher 1984, 1985, 1987; Bruner 1991 and Somers and Gibson 1994). Baker (2006:38) adds that, whether the motivation is commercial or ideological, translators and interpreters play a decisive role in articulating and contesting the full range of public narratives circulating within and around any society at any moment in time.

#### 4. Data analysis

Media or news frames focus on *what* is discussed and *how* it is (or is not) discussed. By the framing of news discourse, the editing team creates a context for their readers. News frames provide a context in which to understand issues, shape the inferences made, reinforce stereotypes, determine judgements and decisions and draw attention to some aspects of reality while obscuring other elements (Gambier 2006:11). To what extent does news undergo a reframing process by means of the translation or transediting process? To what extent does a transeditor reproduce, change or adapt the frames? (Gambier 2006:12). According to Baker (2006:105), transeditors (in this case, the editing teams of News24 and *Nuus24/Netwerk24*) face ethical choices with every assignment to either reproduce existing ideologies as encoded in the narratives elaborated in the text or utterance, or to dissociate themselves from those ideologies or frames. Translators/editors resort to specific strategies to support or undercut particular aspects of the narratives they mediate – explicitly or implicitly.

For this type of study, narrative theory could enable the researcher to conceptualise an identity in the TT which is, for example, not local and culture-specific, but more universal or global (culture-generic). One could even apply the frame of the ‘Us vs. Them-polarisation’ (Van Dijk 1998 in Chen 2009), where narratives framed within the Us-perspective could be used for the STs, and the TTs could be reframed to be read and understood by the Others – those outsiders not belonging to the South African, and specifically the Afrikaner or Afrikaans-speaking, community. If this were the case, it would mean, as Bielsa and Bassnett (2009:2) put it, that “[i]nformation that passes between cultures through news agencies is not only ‘translated’ in the interlingual sense, it is reshaped, edited, synthesized and transformed for the consumption of a new set of readers”. This reshaping of information can also be seen as decontextualisation and then recontextualisation to fit the target reader.

##### 4.1. News24 – Afrikaans into English

The content for News24 and *Nuus24/Netwerk24* is adapted or recreated text taken from local or international news agencies. It involves intralingual translation (English into English, or Afrikaans into Afrikaans) as well as interlingual translation (from Afrikaans/English newspaper articles originally written in Afrikaans/English, and then translated into English/Afrikaans). The interlingual translations are done by freelance translators translating fairly closely to the STs. The TTs are then repackaged by the editorial teams of News24 and *Nuus24/Netwerk24*, i.e. intralingual translation. As Kang (2007:221) puts it: “this involves using language strategically to convey special meanings and to project certain images deliberately”.

One hundred and twenty randomly-chosen news reports were analysed: Afrikaans STs and English TTs as they appeared on the Internet as part of the news coverage of News24. Of these, only two texts were completely rewritten or transcreated to such an extent that the rewriter’s name was added to that of the ST journalist. For the majority of texts it was more a case of transediting with less radical changes, since the readerships do not differ greatly on a cultural level. The lexis were for example not stripped of any cultural implications to be built up from scratch to fit the specific culture of the target reader. If this were the case, Gopinathan (2006:236) would refer to this adaptation process as *transcreation*. The editorial team and not the translators as such adopted the role of interventionists. The modifications were not in the first instance done to better suit the needs of the receivers, but rather to carry an ideological

message. These choices made by the editing team boil down to how certain values and ideas are constructed or framed. These changes are much more subtle, but ideologically speaking, they are much more far-reaching. Fairclough (1995:25) sees media discourse as a social field of both ideological processes and linguistic processes, and a definitive relationship between these two processes exists in the sense that the linguistic choices made in the texts carry ideological meaning.

To what extent then were the English texts that appeared on the news platform News24 framed differently from their Afrikaans counterparts?

#### 4.1.1 Translation strategies

On a basic level, notions of place, space and time were reconfigured in the process of transediting. Only parts of the message to which the target readership could relate were transferred, and this was done in such a way that the relevance to them was enhanced. These strategies added to the reframing of the texts for the News24 reader. From the specific types of adaptations applied to the STs, one can deduce that this news platform is not primarily meant for South Africans using News24 as their primary local newspaper. One of the main strategies applied is *omission*. Many of the reports were seriously shortened by the omission of information regarded as non-newsworthy, non-essential, or too local. *Locality* was not regarded as essential, e.g. burial information and specific addresses of where something had happened were omitted. Locality is important for the Afrikaans newspapers since they are focused on specific areas in South Africa: *Burger* focuses on the Western, Eastern and Northern Cape; *Beeld* focuses on Gauteng, Limpopo, and North-West; and *Volksblad* focuses on the Free State and Northern Cape.

<i>Afrikaans print newspaper</i> <sup>1</sup>	English News24	Original Afrikaans
<b><i>Free State paedophile sentenced</i></b>	Ø Paedophile won't go to jail	<b>Vrystaatse pedofiel gevonniss</b> <i>Die Volksblad, 2009/02/03</i>
<b><i>Pretoria gospel singer Irene van Wyk</i></b>	Ø Singer Irene van Wyk	Die <b>Pretoriase</b> <b>gospel</b> -sangeres Irene van Wyk <i>Beeld, 2008/10/30</i>
<i>Pretorius was shot dead at about 01:00 in his house in <b>Bosloerie Street</b> in Ø Stonehenge, Nelspruit.</i>	Chris died in a shooting on Monday at about 01:00 at his home in Ø Stonehenge, Nelspruit.	Pretorius is gister omstreeks 01:00 in sy huis in <b>Bosloeriestraat</b> in Stonehenge, Nelspruit, doodgeskiet. <i>Beeld, 2009/01/27</i>

<sup>1</sup> English translations are supplied for the original Afrikaans texts throughout.

<p><b>Rain wreaked havoc in Klerksdorp</b></p> <p><i>It seems as though Flamwood was hit the hardest.</i></p> <p><i>Just after 20:00 guests were evacuated from the Protea Hotel in town after the ground floor flooded. The AFM's Oasis congregation saw to it that guests could have breakfast.</i></p>	<p><b>Freak storm floods hospital</b></p> <p>Ø</p> <p>Just after 20:00 guests were evacuated from the Protea Hotel in town after the ground floor flooded. Ø</p>	<p><b>Reën saai groot verwoesting in Klerksdorp</b></p> <p><b>Dit lyk veral of Flamwood die hardste geslaan is.</b></p> <p>Gaste is net ná 20:00 uit die Protea-hotel in die stad geneem nadat die grondverdieping oorstroom is. <b>Die AGS se Oase-gemeente het gisteroggend gesorg dat die gaste onthyt kan eet.</b></p> <p><i>Beeld, 2009/01/23</i></p>
<p><b>British athlete wanders naked in Potch</b></p>	<p><b>Brit takes nude jump for glory Ø</b></p>	<p><b>Britse atleet dwaal kaal by Potch-huis</b></p> <p><i>Beeld, 2009/01/27</i></p>

Some of the choices made during the transediting could be considered as purely linguistic, but they are not only linguistic; they also contribute to the narrative. Just by the omission of one abbreviation and by changing the active voice into passive, a narrative can be intentionally reframed to appeal to more readers. The following heading was adapted to suggest that the well-known businessman Johan Rupert had been involved in a car crash instead of his son driving one of Rupert senior's cars:

<i>Afrikaans print newspaper</i>	<b>English News24</b>	<b>Original Afrikaans</b>
<b>Rupert Jr. did not write off Ferrari</b>	<b>Rupert Ø Ferrari not written off</b>	<b>Rupert jr. het toe nié Ferrari afgeskryf nie</b>
		<i>Beeld, 2008/11/04</i>

From the meagre use of *explicitation* (addition) as a strategy, one can deduce that the intended reader is well acquainted with South Africa. Explicitation is mainly used for the names of smaller opposition political parties and acronyms, mainly abbreviated in the printed newspapers, but fully written-out on the Internet. The ANC (African National Congress), however, was kept abbreviated:

<i>Afrikaans print newspaper</i>	<b>English News24</b>	<b>Original Afrikaans</b>
<i>Ms Rose Gudhluza, <b>ID</b> chairperson in Gauteng ... because he admitted to the Mail and Guardian that he had forged the signatures of prominent people while he was chief of Geda.</i>	Rose Gudhluza, <b>Independent Democrats</b> chairperson in Gauteng ... because he admitted to the <i>Mail and Guardian</i> that he had forged the signatures of prominent people while he was chief of the <b>Gauteng Economic Development Agency (Geda)</b> .	Me. Rose Gudhluza, <b>OD</b> -voorsitter in Gauteng, het gister by die Johannesburgse sentrale polisiekantoor 'n klag van bedrog teen Niehaus gelê omdat hy aan die Mail & Guardian beken het dat hy as <b>Geda</b> -hoof hoëlui se handtekeninge vervals het.  <i>Beeld, 2009/02/16</i>
<i>Mr Ryan Coetzee, <b>DA MP</b>, said the <b>ANC</b> would rather look after corrupt cadres than eradicate the problem.</i>	Ryan Coetzee, <b>Democratic Alliance MP</b> , said the <b>ANC</b> would rather look after corrupt cadres than eradicate the problem.	Mnr. Ryan Coetzee, <b>DA-LP</b> , het gesê die <b>ANC</b> sal eerder na korrupte kaders omsien as om dié probleem uit te roei.  <i>Beeld, 2009/02/16</i>

In only one case did the editor think the Internet reader might not be as well informed as the reader in South Africa, and *Afrikaans singer* was added to the name of Steve Hofmeyr. The identities of other well-known Afrikaans singers, preachers and ex-sportspeople, however, are not explained (e.g. Kurt Darren, Angus Buchan and Joost van der Westhuizen).

In some instances, extra information that might interest the English reader was added:

<i>Afrikaans print newspaper</i>	<b>English News24</b>	<b>Original Afrikaans</b>
<i>... when he threw a cup of tea in the face of Esmaré Weideman, editor of <b>Huisgenoot</b>.</i>	... when he threw a cup of tea in the face of Esmaré Weideman, editor of <i>Huisgenoot</i> , <b>YOU and Drum</b> .	... waarin hy 'n koppie tee in die gesig van me. Esmaré Weideman, redakteur van <b>Huisgenoot</b> , gegooi het.  <i>Beeld, 2008/12/22</i>

Here the English magazines were added to the Afrikaans title, which is the only one that appears in the Afrikaans ST.

The main reason I believe that target readers are primarily South African is that cultural words and phrases are mostly kept in Afrikaans and transferred without any explication. This would indeed seem very foreign to a non-South African reader, and even to a reader with very little knowledge of Afrikaans:



‘Fear of *swart gevaar* drove Nel’ (Heading)

(*swart gevaar* means “black danger”)

... Nel could not handle his fear of the “*swart gevaar*”.

... this fear of black people had changed into hatred of the “*swart gevaar*”.

The Garsfontein High School support team, which includes a psychologist, also called two *dominees* to the school to assist with counselling.

(*dominees* means “ministers/reverends”)

He ran to *Chris*’s bedroom where he and his wife Karenita, 38, were sleeping. “*Oom* Chris jumped up and ran past me. As he went through the door, shots rang out.”

(This story was told by a nephew of Chris. The foreign *oom* (‘uncle’) was not kept as a description of family relationship but rather as a respectful form of address used by Afrikaans-speakers to address older men.)

In one instance, a word borrowed from isiZulu was also transferred:

Because of the illegal occupation, the people had never before complained about the lack of facilities. This was raised by the community at an *imbizo* on Wednesday.

(An *imbizo* is a meeting, usually called together by a traditional leader. It is nowadays used as a general term for meetings where the community is involved.)

Only once was a transferral from Afrikaans explained. The reason for this might be that the news concerned FW de Klerk, in whom a larger number of international readers would be interested. *Slapgat* was explained by *spineless person*, but *slapgat* is much more offensive than *spineless person*. It literally translates into “lame arse”.

<i>Afrikaans print newspaper</i>	English News24	Original Afrikaans
<p><i>Pik's son calls FW a <b>slapgat</b></i></p> <p><i>One of former minister Pik Botha's sons has called F.W. de Klerk a "<b>slapgat</b>" because he <b>walked out of the Government of National Unity (GNU)</b>.</i></p> <p><i>Botha said he used to have lots of respect for De Klerk, but not anymore, referring to his (De Klerk's) "<b>slapgat</b>" behaviour which he showed by <b>walking out of the GNU</b>.</i></p>	<p>Pik's son slams '<b>slapgat</b>' FW</p> <p>One of former minister Pik Botha's sons has called FW de Klerk a "<b>slapgat</b>" (<b>spineless person</b>) because he <b>abandoned</b> the Government of National Unity (GNU).</p> <p>Botha said he used to have a lot of respect for De Klerk, but that was no longer the case because of his (De Klerk's) "<b>slapgat</b>" behaviour in <b>abandoning</b> the GNU.</p>	<p>Pik se seun noem FW 'n '<b>slapgat</b>'</p> <p>'n Seun van oudmin. Pik Botha het oudpres. F.W. de Klerk 'n "<b>slapgat</b>" genoem omdat hy <b>uit</b> die regering van nasionale eenheid <b>gestap het</b>.</p> <p>Hy het baie respek vir De Klerk gehad, maar nie meer nie en het na sy (De Klerk se) "<b>slapgat</b>geit" verwys wat hy openbaar het deur <b>uit</b> die RNE <b>te stap</b>.</p> <p style="text-align: right;"><i>Burger, 2009/01/30</i></p>

Right from the heading, this report is reframed so that the negativity against De Klerk seems harsher than in the Afrikaans report. The Afrikaans heading translates to 'Pik's son calls FW a 'slapgat'', whereas the English heading describes FW as being *slapgat*. Where the Afrikaans report states twice that De Klerk 'walked out' of the Government of National Unity, the English report states twice that De Klerk 'abandoned' the Government of National Unity.

#### 4.1.2 Ideological reframing

The example above illustrates how the choice of lexical elements can lead to a more ideological influence on the reader, in this case a more negative perception of former president FW de Klerk. This shows that, on a deeper level, textual material can be selectively appropriated or manipulated by omissions, additions, accentuations or enhancements of particular aspects of a narrative encoded in the ST as part of the larger narrative(s) in which it is embedded (Baker 2006:114). The reports published in English in News24 were rechanneled according to an ideological agenda which seems less apparent in the Afrikaans STs. Compared to the Afrikaans newspapers, in News24 a much more negative image of post-1994 South Africa is portrayed. This concerns issues of crime, politics and racial issues which were intensified during the transediting process. This constructed reality is maintained throughout and is reinforced by the omission, distortion or misrepresentation of facts where necessary. The adaptations serve to confirm and reinforce News24's seemingly pre-established discourse, namely the intensification of crime, racial issues and the political situation regarding the ANC government.

In some articles, only the headings are adapted to intensify the horror of the various crimes.

### 4.1.3 Crime

<i>Afrikaans print newspaper</i>	English News24	Original Afrikaans
<i>Farmer dies when he tried to stop three robbers</i>	Robbers shoot feisty farmer	Boer sterf toe hy drie rowers wou keer <i>Beeld, 2008/11/03</i>
<i>Kidnapping nightmare</i>	3 women survive horror attack	Ontvoer-nagmerrie <i>Beeld, 2009/02/18</i>

In others, the heading as well as the introductory sentence are adapted by adding information:

<i>Afrikaans print newspaper</i>	English News24	Original Afrikaans
<i>Man who lost arm under train under train thinks robbers pushed him</i>  <i>I must be dreaming, maybe it's only a nightmare</i>	<b>Man pushed from train, loses arm</b>  <b>A man who was pushed out of a train and lost his arm, says he lay on the platform at Benoni station</b> thinking that he must be dreaming, or maybe it was a nightmare	<b>Man wat arm onder trein verloor dink rowers het hom uitgestamp</b>  Ek droom seker, dis dalk net 'n nagmerrie. <i>Beeld, 2009/01/21</i>

In some others, this is achieved by reordering information and changing the passive voice into the active voice to intensify the horror of the event:

Afrikaans print newspaper	English News24	Original Afrikaans
<p><i>Student is fighting for his life after taxi hits and drags him</i></p> <p><i>He was so glad to be at university that his whole personality has changed.</i></p> <p><i>Therefore Mr Zwaai Kruger found it so difficult to believe that his 19-year-old son is now in intensive care in the Netcare Greenacres hospital fighting for his life after <b>he was hit by a taxi</b> and dragged for nearly 30 m.</i></p> <p><i>Jason, a first-year BA student from NMMU who matriculated last year from Knysna High, was seriously injured when <b>he was hit by a taxi</b> on Tuesday. He was crossing Admiralty and University roads on his bicycle at a pedestrian crossing around 17:00 when <b>he was hit by the taxi</b>. The taxi driver, apparently under the influence of alcohol, was arrested on the scene.</i></p>	<p><b>'Drunk' taxi driver hits student</b></p> <p>Ø A taxi driver has been arrested after he hit a 19-year-old on a pedestrian crossing.</p> <p>Jason Kruger is fighting for his life in Netcare Greenacres Hospital after <b>the taxi rammed into him</b> while he was on the crossing at Admiralty and University roads on his bicycle on Tuesday afternoon. The first-year BA student at Nelson Mandela Metropolitan University (NMMU) <b>was dragged behind the vehicle</b> for nearly 30 metres.</p> <p>The taxi driver, who was presumably intoxicated, was arrested on the scene.</p>	<p><b>Student veg om sy lewe ná taxi hom tref en sleep</b></p> <p>Hy was so bly om op universiteit te wees dat sy hele persoonlikheid verander het.</p> <p>Daarom is dit vir mnr. Zwaai Kruger van Sedgefield moeilik om te glo dat sy 19-jarige seun nou in die waakeenheid van die Netcare Greenacres-hospitaal om sy lewe veg nadat <b>hy deur 'n taxi getref</b> en byna 30 m ver gesleep is.</p> <p>Jason, 'n BA-eerstejaarstudent aan die Nelson Mandela Metropolitaanse Universiteit (NMMU) wat verlede jaar aan die Hoërskool Knysna gematrikuleer het, is ernstig beseer toe hy Dinsdag <b>deur 'n taxi getref is</b>. Hy het die voetorgang by die kruising van Admiraliteits- en Universiteitsweg omstreeks 17:00 op sy fiets oorgesteek <b>toe die taxi hom getref het. Die taxibestuurder, wat vermoedelik onder die invloed van alkohol was, is op die toneel in hegtenis geneem.</b></p> <p style="text-align: right;"><i>Burger, 2009/02/26</i></p>

In other articles, the lexical items chosen throughout the target article add to the terror described in the ST:

Afrikaans print newspaper	English News24	Original Afrikaans
<p><b>Elderly person handled roughly when ring did not come off</b></p> <p><i>Ms Sheila Huart and her best friend ms Petra Baxter (62) were <b>held up</b> by two armed <b>men</b> in their security complex in Ontdekkerspark on the West-Rand.</i></p> <p><i>My mother's face was nearly <b>destroyed</b>.</i></p>	<p><b>Robbers try bite ring off finger</b></p> <p>Sheila Huart and her best friend Petra Baxter (62) were <b>attacked</b> by two armed <b>robbers</b> in their townhouse complex.</p> <p>My mother's face was nearly <b>beaten to a pulp</b>.</p>	<p><b>Bejaarde getakel toe ring nie afkom</b></p> <p>Me. Sheila Huart en haar beste vriendin, me. Petra Baxter (62), is in hul veiligheidskompleks in Ontdekkerspark aan die Wes-Rand deur twee gewapende <b>mans oorval</b>.</p> <p>My ma se gesig is byna <b>vernietig</b>.</p> <p><i>Beeld, 2009/02/01</i></p>
<p><b>Alleged sex network uncovered</b></p> <p><i>An alleged sex network of <b>child-molesting</b>, pornography and possibly also rape of which many small children apparently were victims has been uncovered in this town.</i></p> <p><i>The police have confiscated computers and four cell phones that were <b>allegedly</b> used to widely distribute pornography, as well as other pornographic material such as videos and DVDs. <b>It is not yet known whether some of this was child pornography and it was sent away for forensic analysis.</b></i></p>	<p><b>Child sex network uncovered</b></p> <p>An alleged sex network involving pornography, the <b>sexual abuse of children</b> and the possible rape of many small children has been uncovered in this <b>Free State</b> town.</p> <p>The police have confiscated computers and four cell phones that were <b>Ø</b> used to widely distribute pornography, as well as other pornographic material such as videos and DVDs. <b>Ø</b></p>	<p><b>Beweerde seksnetwerk in VS oopgevelek</b></p> <p>'n Beweerde seksnetwerk van <b>kindermolestering</b>, pornografie en moontlik ook verkragting waarin talle klein kinders glo die slagoffers was, is op dié dorp oopgevelek.</p> <p>Die polisie het op rekenaars en vier selfone waarmee pornografie <b>glo</b> wyd rondgestuur is, sowel as ander pornografiese materiaal soos video's en DVD's beslag gelê. <b>Dit is nog nie bekend of daarvan kinderpornografie is nie en dit is vir forensiese ontleding weggestuur.</b></p> <p><i>Volksblad, 2008/11/14</i></p>

In most of the Internet articles, subheadings were added to help steer the reader more quickly through the article or to guide the reader to a specific paragraph. These subheadings were chosen in such a way as to summarize the contents of the article. In doing so, the horror of the events is perceived as even more shocking, since there are no added modalities or other modifying mechanisms.

**Taxi hoots, drives over schoolgirl**  
 'He hit her full-on'  
 A last hug  
 Taxi driver not arrested yet

The following two instances were the only cases in which the horror of two murders were tempered in the News24 articles when compared to the Afrikaans STs.

In one article, only the heading was adapted:

<i>Afrikaans print newspaper</i>	English News24	Original Afrikaans
<i>Murdered when he wanted to help</i>	'Help, I've been shot!'	Vermoord toe hy wil help <i>Beeld, 2009/01/19</i>

In the second article, both the heading and introductory sentences were adapted by reordering the information in the source article:

<i>Afrikaans print newspaper</i>	English News24	Original Afrikaans
<p><b><i>N14 murder: woman wants to leave country</i></b></p> <p><i>'I am angry, very angry.' After the cold-blooded murder of Mr Dieter Furrutter (65) of Roodepoort, his wife Rosie (50), is very seriously considering leaving the country, although she calls it her home. The murder was the worst of a series of crimes her family had suffered.</i></p>	<p><b>'I held his hand for 45 minutes'</b></p> <p>A man has told how he held his friend's hand for 45 minutes while waiting for the police to arrive, after the friend was shot while helping him with his broken down car.</p>	<p><b>N14-moord: vrou wil landuit</b></p> <p>'Ek is kwaad, baie kwaad.'</p> <p>Ná die koelbloedige moord vandeeweek op mnr. Dieter Furrutter (65) van Roodepoort oorweeg sy vrou, Rosie (50), dit nou baie sterk om die land te verlaat, al noem sy dit haar huis.</p> <p>Dié moord was die ergste van 'n reeks misdade waaronder haar gesin al deurgeloop het.</p> <p><i>Beeld, 2009/01/22</i></p>

#### 4.1.4 Politics

In Afrikaans newspapers, very offensive obscenities are never written out in full, whereas News24's policy is to write them out. Just by this strategy, the negative impact of the contents can be heightened. Compare the following two incidents involving people from various races where the racial issues were intensified in News24. The first article was about a young white male who went on a rampage shooting black people in an informal settlement. News24 also added information not found in the Afrikaans report.

<i>Afrikaans print newspaper</i>	English News24	Original Afrikaans
<p>“Come out, you bloody <b>k****rs</b>. I want to kill you today, you <b>black arses</b>.”</p> <p>Maema said Nel stopped shooting because he ran out of ammunition.</p>	<p>“Come out, you bloody <b>kaffirs</b>. I want to kill you today, you <b>black bastards</b>.”</p> <p>Maema said Nel stopped shooting because he ran out of ammunition.  <b>According to the charge sheet Nel had fired at least 125 rounds. When he ran out of ammunition, he went to farmers in the area and asked for more ammunition. They refused to help him</b></p>	<p>“Kom uit, julle bleddie <b>k****rs</b>. Ek wil julle vandag doodmaak, julle <b>swart gatte</b>.”</p> <p>Volgens Maema het Nel opgehou skiet omdat sy ammunisie opgeraak het.</p> <p><i>Beeld, 2008/11/20</i></p>

The actions of the notorious VIP-protection units of ANC political leaders, usually consisting of black policemen, were intensified by the use of *terror* in the heading as well as the writing-out of the obscenities:

<i>Afrikaans print newspaper</i>	English News24	Original Afrikaans
<p><b><i>When I say *** out of the road, you have to *** out of the road!</i></b></p>	<p><b>Blue light terror for motorist</b></p>	<p><b>‘As ek sê *** uit die pad moet jy uit die pad ***!’</b></p>
<p><i>When I say *** out of the road, you have to *** out of the road!</i></p>	<p>“When I say <b>fuck off</b> out of the road, you have to <b>fuck off</b> out of the road!”</p>	<p>“Wanneer ek sê f** uit die pad, moet jy uit die pad f**!”</p> <p><i>Beeld, 2009/02/26</i></p>

An article that mostly focuses on the various opposition parties was translated fairly close to the ST, but when a referral to the ANC’s power was made, much more negative words were used in the News24 version:

<i>Afrikaans print newspaper</i>	English News24	Original Afrikaans
<p><i>According to him people should vote for Cope because it was the only party since the democratic transition <b>that can take away the power of the ANC</b>.</i></p>	<p>He said people should vote for Cope because it was the only party since the democratic transition <b>that can break the ANC’s stranglehold</b>.</p>	<p>Volgens hom moet mense vir Cope stem omdat dit die enigste party sedert die demokratiese oorgang is <b>wat die mag by die ANC kan afneem</b>.</p> <p><i>Burger, 2009/02/02</i></p>

Carl Niehaus, former ambassador to the Netherlands and spokesperson for the ANC, was accused of stealing money, forging signatures of other dignitaries to get more money, being unable to pay his debt, and littering his CV with “lies and misrepresentations”. During the apartheid regime, Niehaus and his former wife had been jailed for their political actions as members of the ANC. Under ANC rule he was taken up into the party “cadres”, divorced his former wife and was married twice to black women, living a life of luxury. The newspapers

lapped up the fall of Niehaus, but once again, his shame and demise are greatly intensified in the reworked articles in News24. After the heading, there are four short paragraphs in the ST regarding his resignation as spokesperson for the ANC, his redeployment to a new job in the ANC, and the ANC's lack of awareness of everything being revealed in the press and by Niehaus himself. All of this is omitted in the TT, and the News24 article starts with the next sentence in the ST:

<i>Afrikaans print newspaper</i>	<b>English News24</b>	<b>Original Afrikaans</b>
<b><i>Carl Niehaus resigns</i></b>	<b>More Niehaus lies revealed</b>	<b>Carl Niehaus bedank</b>
Introduction	Introduction omitted	Mnr. Carl Niehaus, gewese ANC-woordvoerder, het gisteraand uit sy nuwe werk in die ANC bedank nadat nóg van sy leuens aan die lig gekom het.
		Hy bly egter 'n lid van die ANC, het me. Jessie Duarte, ANC-woordvoerder bevestig.
		Die ANC het sy bedanking aanvaar. Niehaus is Vrydag uit sy pos as woordvoerder na 'n nuwe pos in die ANC geskuif.
		Me. Lindiwe Zulu, 'n ander ANC-woordvoerder, het vroeër gesê die ANC "was nie bewus van alles wat nou deur die media en Carl self op die tafel geplaas is nie".
<i>Another string of lies by Niehaus became known.</i>	Carl Niehaus's lies seem to know no end.	Nog 'n string leuens deur Niehaus het gister bekend geword.
No addition	Added to end of article:  On Tuesday The Star reported that Cheryl Clur, owner of the Let's Travel travel agency in East London, said that Niehaus had defrauded her by convincing her to organise him a free holiday in Mauritius.  He told her he had leukaemia and that he needed to recover after receiving chemotherapy. She lost R90 000. At the time of publication, Niehaus's CV was still available on LitNet.	<i>Beeld</i> , 2009/02/17



Another article on Niehaus also carries a much more negative heading on the Internet. In this same article, the ANC is repudiated for not taking stronger steps against Niehaus. In the Afrikaans text, the utterance is softened by using the passive voice, whereas the English active version seems much more factual:

<i>Afrikaans print newspaper</i>	<b>English News24</b>	<b>Original Afrikaans</b>
<p><b><i>Eviction order maybe soon for Niehaus</i></b></p> <p><i>“The party can’t distinguish right from wrong and it becomes far too easy to excuse criminal actions based on the perception that ANC members should be subjected to lower moral standards than the rest of South Africa.”</i></p>	<p><b>Niehaus to be kicked out of home</b></p> <p>“The party can’t distinguish right from wrong and it becomes far too easy to excuse criminal actions based on the perception <b>that lower moral standards are valid for ANC members than for the rest of South Africa.</b>”</p>	<p><b>Uitsettingsbevel dalk gou vir Niehaus</b></p> <p>“Die party kan nie reg van verkeerd onderskei nie en dit word alte maklik om misdadige optrede te verskoon op grond van die idee <b>dat ANC-lede aan ’n laer morele standaard onderwerp moet word as die res van Suid-Afrika.</b>”</p> <p style="text-align: right;"><i>Beeld, 2009/02/16</i></p>

In one article that describes South Africans’ views regarding gay marriage, the strong conservative outlook apparent in the ST is minimized in the TT. Interestingly enough, however, the fact that black South Africans did not tolerate gays was strengthened in the News24 text. South Africa as a country was placed in a better light, but black people were placed in a more negative light:

<i>Afrikaans print newspaper</i>	<b>English News24</b>	<b>Original Afrikaans</b>
<p><b><i>Being gay is wrong, 80% here say</i></b></p> <p><i>More than 80% of the population aged 16 years and above <b>believes</b> sex between two men or two women “always to be wrong”.</i></p> <p><i>Black people were more intolerant of homosexuality than white or coloured people, as well as rural inhabitants and people with little schooling.</i></p>	<p><b>80% of SA says no to gays</b></p> <p>More than 80% of the population aged 16 years and above <b>expressed the view</b> that sex between two men or two women <b>could be considered</b> “always wrong”.</p> <p>Black people were more intolerant of homosexuality than white or coloured people Ø.</p>	<p><b>Gaywees is verkeerd, sê 80% hier</b></p> <p>Meer as 80% van die bevolking bo die ouderdom van 16 <b>glo</b> seks tussen twee mans of twee vroue <b>is</b> “altyd verkeerd”.</p> <p>Swart mense was meer onverdraagsaam as wit en bruin mense, <b>asook landelike inwoners en mense met min skoolopleiding.</b></p> <p style="text-align: right;"><i>Beeld, 2008/12/09</i></p>

#### 4.2. Nuus24/Netwerk24 – English into Afrikaans

Could this be commercial? Maybe News24 only wants to lure more readers away from their opposition, International News Online (IOL), by means of increased sensationalism, almost like

the tabloid press. Baker (2006:106) states that the tabloid press in most countries tends to exaggerate sensational aspects of public narratives in a bid to improve the newspaper's circulation. The changes described above cannot all be ascribed to an ideological agenda. If this were the case, the same recreation processes would apply in the reworking of news reports in the English print media for the Afrikaans Internet platform *Nuus24/Netwerk24*. One would expect a much more negative image of post-1994 South Africa, where issues of crime, politics and racial issues are intensified during the transediting process. To investigate this, 50 ideologically-coloured news reports were chosen, with the English ST in the print media and the Afrikaans TT as it appeared on the Internet as part of the news coverage by *Nuus24/Netwerk24*.

All the English reports were substantially shortened for *Nuus24/Netwerk24*. The shortened reports consisted mainly of a paraphrase in Afrikaans of the original English print report, but with a comment to "click here for the complete report" with a link to the complete report in the Internet version of the original newspaper.

#### 4.2.1 Headings

Most of the headings were adapted. In only three cases are the Afrikaans headings a direct translation of the English, namely:

Action expected on Zuma's bully bodyguards	Stappe kom teen Zuma se boelie-wagte <i>Nuus24, 2010/03/18</i>
Zuma shows Simelane who's boss	Zuma wys Simelane wie's baas <i>Nuus24, 2010/05/14</i>
DA wins two of three by-elections in KZN	DA wen twee derdes in KZN-tussenverkiesing <i>Nuus24, 2010/05/06</i>

In the following eight examples, the Afrikaans headings are more explicit and sometimes also less euphemistic than the English ones:

<i>English print newspaper</i>	<i>Afrikaans Nuus24</i>	<i>Original Afrikaans</i>
<i>Now Shaka statue must go</i>	Shaka statue <b>not good enough for Zulu king</b>	Shaka-standbeeld <b>nie goed genoeg vir Zoeloe-koning</b> <i>Nuus24, 2010/06/02</i>
<i>Thabo Mbeki's Shaik-down</i>	Mbeki <b>advises Shaik on business with the ANC</b>	Mbeki <b>adviseer Shaik oor besigheid met die ANC</b> <i>Nuus24, 2010/08/15</i>
<i>Khoza's daughter speaks out</i>	Khoza's daughter <b>denies Zuma love-child</b>	Khoza se dogter <b>ontken Zuma-liefdeskind</b> <i>Nuus24, 2010/02/02</i>
<i>Malema dares Zuma</i>	<b>Zuma worse than Mbeki – Malema</b>	<b>Zuma erger as Mbeki – Malema</b> <i>Nuus24, 2010/04/12</i>

<i>Shiceka: Hey big spender</i>	<b>Minister apparently lies in CV</b>	<b>Minister jok glo op CV</b> <i>Nuus 24, 2010/05/21</i>
<i>Pick n Pay workers to strike</i>	Workers of Pick n Pay will <b>also be on strike</b>	Werkers van Pick n Pay <b>gaan ook staak</b> <i>Nuus24, 2010/08/31</i>
<i>Malema's assets could be attached today</i>	Malema: <b>Bailiff will not take my stuff</b>	Malema: <b>Balju sal nie my goed vat</b> <i>Nuus24, 2010/10/18</i>
<i>Journo forced to delete pictures</i>	<b>Zuma security believed to attack journalist</b>	<b>Zuma-sekuriteit val glo joernalis aan</b> <i>Nuus24, 2010/03/17</i>

As the data show, however, the Afrikaans headings are in most cases more neutral and more euphemistic; in other words, less negative towards the ANC government and its allies:

<i>English print newspaper</i>	<i>Afrikaans Nuus24</i>	<b>Original Afrikaans</b>
<i>Mugabe celebrates birthday amid distress</i>	Mugabe <b>gives party</b>	Mugabe <b>hou partytjie</b> <i>Nuus24, 2010-02-27</i>
<i>Cop bungle may boost Jub Jub</i>	<b>Police negligence can help</b> Jub Jub	<b>Polisie se nalatigheid kan Jub Jub help</b> <i>Nuus24, 2010/05/12</i>
<i>Defiant Vavi won't say sorry</i>	Vavi refuses to say sorry	Vavi weier om jammer te sê <i>Nuus24, 2010/06/11</i>
<i>Inside an ANC cover-up The Mandela Archives: The billionaire, the bureaucrat and the missing party funds</i>	Letter shows <b>top ANC members investigated for fraud</b>	Briewe wys <b>top ANC-lede is vir bedrog ondersoek</b> <i>Nuus24, 2010/08/22</i>
<i>Don't ignore SA's painful history</i>	Don't ignore <b>the past</b> , says Motlanthe	Moenie <b>die verlede</b> ignoreer, sê Motlanthe <i>Nuus24, 2010/06/02</i>
<i>Reporter: I was paid to pursue Rasool agenda</i>	Reporter was <b>spin-doctor for Rasool</b>	Joernalis <b>was beeldpoetser vir Rasool</b> <i>Nuus24, 2010/06/30</i>

<i>Madiba confessed to immoral life</i>	<b>Book reveals Mandela's wild years</b>	<b>Boek ontbloot Mandela se wilde jare</b> <i>Nuus24, 2010/05/31</i>
<i>Outcry about R5m soccer tickets</i>	<b>Government buys World Cup tickets for R5 million</b>	<b>Regering koop R5 miljoen se WB-kaartjies</b> <i>Nuus24, 2010/06/03</i>
<i>Top Hawks officer accused of racial slur</i>	<b>Top Hawk in racial uproar</b>	<b>Top-Valk in rasseherrie gedompel</b> <i>Nuus24, 2010/05/13</i>
<i>MaNtuli pays for cheating on Zuma</i>	<b>Zuma wife apparently punished earlier</b>	<b>Zuma-vrou glo vroeër gestraf</b> <i>Nuus24, 2010/06/04</i>
<i>Gauteng's head of prisons guilty of fraud</i>	<b>Female head of prisons in hot water</b>	<b>Vroulike tronkhoof in sop</b> <i>Nuus24, 2010/10/13</i>
<i>20 miners executed</i>	<b>Newspaper makes horror discovery at controversial mine</b>	<b>Koerant maak gru-vonds by omstrede myn</b> <i>Nuus24, 2010/08/12</i>

#### 4.2.2 Reports

Headings pave the way for what is expected in the reports themselves, or they literally frame the narrative. As already said, the Afrikaans Internet versions all consist of a much-shortened paraphrase of the original English print report. The paraphrases of almost all of the 50 investigated reports lead to a much more neutral and sometimes even euphemistic read compared to the English print reports:

<i>English print newspaper</i>	<i>Afrikaans Nuus24</i>	<i>Original Afrikaans</i>
<i>police grossly irresponsible;</i> <i>blood test blunder</i>	<b>Omission;</b> <b>slip-up</b>	<b>glips</b> <i>Nuus24, 2010/05/12</i>
<i>a journalist was assaulted;</i> <i>an online journalist at 702 was accosted by the SAPS VIP Protection Unit;</i> <i>three of them threatened me</i>	a journalist was <b>harassed</b> ; <b>Omission;</b> <b>Omission;</b>	'n verslaggewer is <b>geteister</b> <i>Nuus24, 2010/03/17</i>

<i>were investigated for allegedly <b>colluding to enrich themselves</b> by using ANC funds</i>	they allegedly <b>used</b> ANC funds	hulle <b>na bewering</b> ANC fondse gebruik het  <i>Nuus24, 2010/08/22</i>
advised Shaik to set up a business <b>empire</b> – specifically for the benefit of the <b>cash-strapped</b> ruling party	advised Shaik to set up a business Ø  specifically for the benefit of the Ø ruling party	Shaik aangeraai het om 'n besigheid op te bou Ø  spesifiek met die doel om die Ø regerende party te bevoordeel. <i>Nuus24, 2010/08/15</i>
<i>odious acts of the past</i>	<b>injustices</b> of the past	<b>onregte</b> van die verlede  <i>Nuus24, 2010/06/02</i>
<i>South Africans may have come to terms with President Jacob Zuma's infidelity, but a new book to be released next month about Nelson Mandela claims the country's first democratic president was <b>no saint</b> either</i>	<b>Omission.</b> A new book about Nelson Mandela makes it clear that the sanctified leader had <b>no innocent love-life</b>	'n Nuwe boek oor oud-president Nelson Mandela maak dit duidelik dat dié opgehemelde leier glad <b>nie 'n onskuldige liefdeslewe</b> gehad het nie.  <i>Nuus24, 2010/05/31</i>
<i>A political analyst has warned of the <b>chilling effect</b> the actions of Julius Malema could have on democracy in South Africa;</i>  <i>Malema's use of policemen to <b>crush</b> his opposition</i>	A political analyst has warned that the actions of youth leader Julius Malema could be " <b>dangerous</b> " for democracy;  the <b>controversial</b> Malema has used policemen to <b>remove</b> his opposition	'n Politieke analis het gewaarsku dat die optrede van die ANC Jeugliga-leier Julius Malema tydens die liga se konferensie in Makhado in Limpopo, ' <b>gevaarlik</b> ' kan wees vir demokrasie  <b>omstrede</b> Malema polisie gebruik om sy teenstanders <b>uit die weg te ruim</b>  <i>Nuus24, 2010/06/18</i>
<i>the news of Winnie Mandela's <b>verbal attack</b> on her ex-husband, Nelson Mandela;</i>	Winnie Mandela's <b>commentary</b> on Nelson Mandela	Mandela se <b>kommentaar</b> oor Nelson Mandela  <i>Nuus24, 2010/03/10</i>
<i>with the SABC <b>splurging</b> R3.3m on more than 2,000 tickets</i>	while the SABC <b>spent</b> R3,3 million on more than 2 000 tickets	terwyl die SABC R3,3 miljoen op meer as 2 000 kaartjies <b>spandeer</b> het  <i>Nuus24, 2010/06/03</i>

<p>where ANC supporters <b>trashed</b> a Democratic Alliance meeting, has been won by the DA</p>	<p>where ANC supporters <b>interrupted</b> a Democratic Alliance meeting, has been won by the DA</p>	<p>waar ANC-ondersteuners 'n DA-vergadering <b>onderbreek</b> het, is nou deur die DA gewen</p> <p><i>Nuus24, 2010/05/27</i></p>
<p><b>A government car for his girlfriend, a state-funded party for his mother and a dodgy CV -- Sicelo Sicheka's qualifications for membership of the interministerial task team on corruption are looking threadbare</b></p>	<p><b>Omission</b></p>	<p><i>Nuus24, 2010/05/21</i></p>
<p>Malema was found guilty of hate speech for saying <b>President Jacob Zuma's rape accuser had enjoyed herself.</b></p>	<p>Malema was found guilty of hate speech. <b>Omission</b></p>	<p>hy skuldig bevind is aan haatspraak.</p> <p><i>Nuus24, 2010/10/18</i></p>
<p>Malema <b>lashed out</b> when the Star asked him how he could afford to buy a R3,6m house cash.</p>	<p>Malema <b>was upset</b> when the Star asked him how he could afford to buy a R3,6m house cash.</p>	<p>Malema <b>het</b> baie <b>ontsteld geraak</b> toe The Star vroeër die week gevra het hoe hy dit kan bekostig om 'n huis van R3,6 miljoen kontant te koop.</p> <p><i>Nuus24, 2010/02/19</i></p>
<p>we have observed through the media that their (ANCYL) conference registration process was <b>utterly chaotic</b> and now allegations have surfaced that the voting process <b>was rigged.</b></p>	<p>ANCYL's conference was <b>afflicted by logistical problems</b> and delegates who walked out because of <b>alleged rigging</b> of votes.</p>	<p>Die ANCYL se kongres is egter <b>geteister deur logistieke probleme</b> en afgevaardigdes wat uitgestap het weens <b>beweerde knoeieri</b> met stemme.</p> <p><i>Nuus24, 2010/05/24</i></p>
<p>In an exclusive story the Sowetan reports that security guards allegedly went on a <b>killing spree</b> at a mine owned by the nephew of President Jacob Zuma and grandson of Nelson Mandela. The guards reportedly <b>gunned down</b> at least 20 people at the Aurora Mine in Springs, Ekurhuleni, and <b>left the bodies to rot underground.</b></p>	<p>The Sowetan reported in an exclusive story that security guards went on a wild <b>shooting spree</b> at the controversial Aurora mine. The <b>mine is partly owned</b> by President Jacob Zuma's nephew and Nelson Mandela's grandson. The guards reportedly <b>shot dead</b> about 20 people and <b>hid their bodies underground where they started to decompose.</b></p>	<p>Die Sowetan het in 'n eksklusiewe storie berig dat sekuriteitswagte op 'n wilde <b>skiettog</b> gegaan het by die omstrede Aurora-myn in Springs. Dié myn <b>word gedeeltelik besit</b> deur pres. Jacob Zuma se neef en Nelson Mandela se kleinseun. Na bewering het die sekuriteitswagte Maandag sowat 20 mense <b>doodgeskiet</b> en <b>hul lyke ondergronds versteek</b> waar die lyke begin het om te ontbind.</p> <p><i>Nuus24, 2010/08/12</i></p>

<i>corrupt police officers have no place in the South African Police Service (SAPS) and they will be <b>rooted out</b>.</i>	corrupt police officers have no place in the South African Police Service (SAPS) and they will be <b>removed</b> .	korrupte polisiebeamptes geen plek in die Suid-Afrikaanse polisie diens (SAPD) het nie en dat hulle <b>verwyder</b> sal word.  <i>Nuus24, 2010/10/20</i>
<i>The problem is getting <b>worse and worse</b> and it <b>obviously places</b> the lives of ordinary South Africans <b>at a huge risk</b>.</i>	The problem is <b>only getting worse</b> and it <b>Ø places</b> the lives of ordinary South Africans <b>in danger</b> .	Die probleem <b>raak net erger</b> en dit <b>plaas</b> die lewens van gewone Suid-Afrikaners <b>in gevaar</b>  <i>Nuus24, 2010/10/21</i>

In only one report, commenting on election results, the Afrikaans paraphrase seems more definite than the English print report:

<i>English print newspaper</i>	<i>Afrikaans Nuus24</i>	<i>Original Afrikaans</i>
<i>The ANC polled 37.7 percent,</i>	The ANC polled <b>only</b> 37.7 percent.	Die ANC het <b>slegs</b> 37.7% van die stemme verkry.  <i>Nuus24, 2010/05/27</i>
<i><b>down from 53 percent in 2006.</b></i>	<b>Omission.</b>	
<i>The ANC has not won <b>a ward</b> in the Western Cape since the April 2009 national election.</i>	The ANC has not won a <b>single</b> ward in the Western Cape since the April 2009 national election.	Die ANC het sedert die verkiesing in April 2009, nog nie 'n <b>enkele</b> wyk in die Wes-Kaap gewen nie.  <i>Nuus24, 2010/05/27</i>

If the content is taken into account, the reporting is not on something negative done by the ANC or one of the party members, but on the fact that the ANC did not perform well in a recent election. The latter is then emphasised in the Afrikaans version.

To summarise, this investigation produced the same results as the previous investigation: the reports for the Afrikaans readers are more likely to be framed in a less negative, less intensified way than the versions meant for the English readers. This occurs regardless of the news genre, i.e. print media or Internet platform. These results also prove that the previous investigation's finding of a more negative, more intensified reframing of Afrikaans reports in the print media for the English Internet reader is not due to the wish to generate more sensation, but is linked to the language and/or cultural group: the same less negative, less intensified way of framing was found in the Afrikaans data, although the Afrikaans stories now appeared on the Internet platform.

### 4.3. News24 – English into English

To see whether the ideological reframing only occurs in interlingual situations, 50 ideologically-coloured news reports were investigated. These were English STs taken from the two print newspapers, *City Press* and *The Witness*, and their English TTs as they appeared on the Internet as part of the news coverage of News24.

On a more basic level, notions of place, space and time were reconfigured in the process of transediting the texts for the Internet. This led to somewhat shortened texts throughout, by omitting all references to specific times, dates and days of the week. Also, all titles of persons referred to were omitted, and all denominations were abbreviated, e.g. *billion* vs. *bn*; *million* vs. *m*. In my opinion, some of these omissions produced better journalism, in the sense that meaningless and insignificant information, e.g. quotations stating “no comment”, was left out.

Explicitation is another strategy applied to the reframing of the print newspaper texts for the News24 reader, from which one could deduce that the Internet newsreader might not be as familiar with the South African situation as the reader of print newspapers. Acronyms used in print newspapers were either

- written out the first time they were used:  
*Cosatu* vs. *Congress of South African Trade Unions*;
- labelled by means of brackets:  
*BEE* vs. *BEE (black economic empowerment)*  
*NWC* [*national working committee*]; or
- generic words were added after e.g. titles of newspapers:  
*Star* vs. *Star newspaper*.

The layout in the Internet version was changed mostly in order to provide an easier read: paragraphs were adapted into single-sentence paragraphs, and subheadings were inserted so that the reader could get the gist of the report by only reading the heading and the subheadings.

#### 4.3.1 Headings

Some print newspaper headings tended to be more metaphorical than their Internet counterparts, which tended to be more descriptive and therefore more neutral:

<i>English print newspaper</i>	<b>English News24</b>
<i>UIF to cushion the fall</i>	<b>UIF plans to extend benefit period</b>
<i>Zuma: business not the BEE-all of empowerment</i>	<b>Zuma concerned about BEE</b>
<i>Lifeline for black farmers</i>	<b>KZN to rescue failed land reform farms</b>
<i>Zuma fires fong con</i>	<b>Zuma fires conman</b>



Most of the adaptations leading to a more ideological reframing were found in the recreation of the headings. It seems that the headings used in print newspapers were more scathing and more explicit in their criticism than those used on News24. Some of these harsher headings were also metaphoric, whereas the more descriptive headings tended to be more neutral:

<i>English print newspaper</i>	<b>English News24</b>
<i>Cosatu bleeds</i>	Cosatu <b>to stem member exodus</b>
<i>Malema's company scores – again</i>	Malema <b>got four deals in one month</b>
<i>Business leaders rule out sympathy strikes</i>	<b>Doubts over</b> sympathy strike
<i>State forges a bigger role in the economy</i>	<b>Business uneasy over govt intervention</b>
<i>Manuel's letter to Manyi leaves ANCYL fuming</i>	<b>Manuel a right-wing force, says ANCYL</b>
<i>How did Guptas qualify for BEE steel deal?</i>	<b>Guptas under scrutiny</b>
<i>'Strange time' for Mthembu to be drunk</i>	<b>ANC looking into Mthembu arrest</b>
<i>Agliotti: Friendship, business behind Selebi payments</i>	Selebi payments <b>'for friendship'</b>

There were some exceptions where the Internet headings were found to be harsher and more explicit than those of the reports in print newspapers, albeit not markedly so:

<i>English print newspaper</i>	<b>English News24</b>
<i>Mining houses still fail to meet BEE targets</i>	Miners <b>fail</b> to meet BEE targets
<i>Firms are failing black youth</i>	Firms <b>fail</b> black youth
<i>'AWB man' threatened Zuma with snipers</i>	'AWB man' <b>threatens to kill Zuma</b>
<i>Hitting them where it hurts</i>	<b>Manyi: 'I'll hit where it hurts'</b>

#### 4.3.2 Reports

Apart from the textual changes already discussed, the content of the Internet reports is identical to that of the print reports. In only two reports did I find adaptations that could be attributed to ideological motivation. In the first example quoted here, a sentence was added at the opening

of the Internet report. This immediately reframes the report in a more negative way, although the heading suggests a rather positive report.

<i>English print newspaper</i>	<b>English News24</b>
<i>Black directors arrive on JSE</i>	Black directors arrive on JSE
Ø	<b>If SA continues to neglect the plight of the jobless the country will go the way of Egypt, according to a Rhodes University lecturer.</b>

In the other report, which deals with the killing of the AWB leader Eugene Terre'Blanche, the Internet variation appears more sympathetic towards one of the accused than the print version. Some lexical items were added to the Internet version. The heading was also slightly adapted:

<i>English print newspaper</i>	<b>English News24</b>
<i>Grisly details of Terre'Blanche <b>murder</b></i>	Grisly details <b>emerge</b> of Terre'Blanche <b>killing</b>
<i>Chris Mahlangu (27) listened impassively as investigating officer Tsietsi Mano testified how the brutality of the Easter weekend murder had disturbed him.</i>	Chris Mahlangu, 27, <b>a slender man</b> , listened impassively as investigating officer Tsietsi Mano testified how the brutality of the Easter Weekend murder had disturbed him.
<i>"Accused number two (<b>the minor</b>) said his (Mahlangu's) intention was to dismember – but thereafter he left it," said Mano.</i>	"Accused number two ( <b>the youth</b> ) said his (Mahlangu's) intention was to dismember – but thereafter he left it," said Mano.

All in all, it seems as though the reworked Internet versions of the English print reports are less harsh than their print counterparts. Once again, this defies the suggestion that Internet reporting tends to exaggerate sensational aspects of public narratives to increase readership. The opposite is proved here.

#### **4.4 Nuus24/Netwerk24 – Afrikaans into Afrikaans**

To complete this investigation, I scrutinised Afrikaans print-newspaper reports and their corresponding items on the Afrikaans Internet platform, *Nuus24/Netwerk24* – also an intralingual situation. Fifty ideologically-coloured news reports were chosen with the Afrikaans STs in the print media and the Afrikaans TTs as they appeared on the Internet as part of the news coverage of *Nuus24/Netwerk24*.

Almost no changes were found between the two versions; the only adaptations were that the reports were shortened for the Internet by the omission of all titles of people and most adverbs and nouns referring to specific dates. Adverbs like *yesterday*, *today* and *tomorrow* were either omitted or rephrased into nouns, e.g. *Monday*.

Regarding the layout, the same was found for the intralingual English-into-English adaptations, in that the Internet version was mostly changed to provide an easier read: paragraphs were adapted into single-sentence paragraphs and subheadings were inserted so that the reader could get the gist of the report by only reading the heading and subheadings.

#### 4.4.1 Headings

Most headings were shortened considerably for the Internet version. Other than that, two cases were found where the headings in *Nuus24/Netwerk24* were more explicit, which led to a harsher impression:

<i>Afrikaans print newspaper</i>	Original Afrikaans	<i>Afrikaans Nuus24/Netwerk24</i>	Original Afrikaans
<i>Billy goes farming in Zim</i>	Billy gaan in Zim boer <i>Beeld</i> , 2010/01/14	Controversial businessman obtains land in Zim	Omstrede sakeman kry grond in Zim <i>Nuus24</i> , 2010/01/14
<i>ANC VIPs spring to attention when Malema phones</i>	ANC-hoës spring op aandag toe Malema bel <i>Rapport</i> , 2009/11/02	Malema apparently scolded traffic police	Malema skel glo verkeersbeamptes uit <i>Nuus24</i> , 2009/11/01
<i>Malema uses blue light</i>	Malema <b>gebruik</b> blou lig <i>Beeld</i> , 2009/11/05	Malema <b>speeds</b> with blue light	Malema <b>jaag</b> met blou lig <i>Nuus24</i> , 2009/11/05

In one case, a heading seems more euphemistic in the Internet version because of an added adverb:

<i>Afrikaans print newspaper</i>	Original Afrikaans	<i>Afrikaans Nuus24/Netwerk24</i>	Original Afrikaans
<i>Julius Malema cheats taxman</i>	Julius Malema kul Jan Taks <i>Rapport</i> , 2010/03/10	Julius Malema <b>apparently</b> cheats taxman	Malema kul <b>glo</b> Jan Taks <i>Nuus24</i> , 2010/03/07

#### 4.4.2 Reports

Apart from the few textual changes already discussed, the contents of the Afrikaans Internet reports are identical to those of the Afrikaans print reports. The situation is the same as that of the intralingual translation for English. In the 50 reports investigated, I found only one adaptation that could be attributed to an ideological motivation, where a direct quotation from the print version was omitted at the end of the Internet report. This led to a less harsh report, although the heading in the Internet text was perceived as being more negative towards Malema:

<i>Afrikaans print newspaper</i>	<b>Original Afrikaans</b>	<i>Afrikaans Nuus24/Netwerk24</i>	<b>Original Afrikaans</b>
<i>ANC VIPs spring to attention when Malema phones</i>	ANC-hoë spring op aandag toe Malema bel <i>Rapport, 2009/11/02</i>	Malema apparently scolded traffic police	Malema skel glo verkeersbeamptes uit <i>Nuus24, 2009/11/01</i>
<i>"Who do you think you are? Don't you realise I am Julius, president of the Youth League? I know some of you hate me."</i>  <i>- Mr Julius Malema to traffic police.</i>	<b>"Wie dink julle is julle? Besef julle nie ek is Julius, president van die jeugliga, nie? Ek weet van julle haat my."</b>  <b>– mnr. Julius Malema aan verkeersbeamptes</b>  <i>Rapport, 2009/11/02</i>	<b>Omitted</b>	

Because of the very few differences found between the Afrikaans print and Afrikaans Internet reports, no argument could be made for a more sensational reframing of Internet reports by the editorial team dealing with these intralingual transeditings.

## 5. Conclusion

Baker (2006:19) emphasises that the way in which texts are framed focuses on the power and function of narratives, rather than their structural make-up. The emphasis is therefore on the fact that narrative shapes people's views of rationality, of objectivity, of morality and their conceptions of themselves and others. It is also important to consider the fact that I, as the researcher, am not unaffected by the narratives that form my own sentiments of the world and the events that shape my life. Baker reminds scholars that "[t]he ethical systems by which we judge cultural narratives are themselves cultural narratives" (Ryan 2003 in Baker 2006:129). As such, a similar investigation by other researchers might result in different findings.

It is therefore important to realise the responsibility the editing team has in this news environment where they have the power to shape the minds of their readership by means of the narratives they create. My research has found a definite reframing of information for the English and Afrikaans readerships, regardless of the genre of media platform used; in other words, frame ambiguity does occur between these two readerships. For the Afrikaans readership, the reports were phrased in more neutral terms, or they were less sensational, less harsh and less negative than their English counterparts. Bear in mind that all the print newspapers and the two Internet news platforms belong to the same publishing house, Media24: the different treatment of the news aimed at the two language groups thus has to be a conscious in-house decision. The ideological component is one of the main role-players in the manipulation of texts, and here it seems to be the main reason for the reframing of the media reports for the readerships of the two language groups. Ideology is seen to be the "grillwork of form, convention and belief which orders our actions" (Jameson in Lefevere 1992:16). Ideology also refers to ideas, value concepts and assumptions, which can be cultural or political and are related to the power and authority of persons and institutions in a specific society. Abdulla (in Aksoy 2001 in Feinauer 2008:222)

mentions that ideology refers to the propositions and assumptions we hold *consciously and unconsciously* about ourselves which guide our actions (own emphasis).

This rechannelling of information for the English reader in News24 (mainly in interlingual transediting from Afrikaans into English) and for the Afrikaans reader in *Nuus24/Netwerk24* (mainly in interlingual transediting from English into Afrikaans) could possibly be ascribed to the following: since the Afrikaans press was considered the official mouthpiece of the National Party and its infamous policy of apartheid, they do not want to come out too strongly in Afrikaans against ANC-ruled South Africa. Unburdened by this stigma, the English press – especially a newspaper with a majority black readership and a black editor like *City Press* – has fewer reservations about painting a much bleaker picture of the news.

Another reason for the Afrikaans media to frame post-apartheid South Africa in a more positive way could be that many white Afrikaans citizens, especially males aged 45 and above, are feeling marginalised and vulnerable in post-apartheid South Africa. They have had to go through a profound psychological adaptation in making sense of their situation and function in a rapidly-changing environment. In a relatively short time, they have lost their position of power, control and authority. See Steyn (2001) for a description of the five dominant post-apartheid narratives among white Afrikaans-speaking people, namely:

- still colonial after all these years;
- this shouldn't happen to a white person;
- don't think white, then it's all right;
- a whiter shade of white; or
- under African skies, or white, but not quite.

Therefore the Afrikaans media do not want to pour oil on the already-burning fire.

This research could and should be extended to include an investigation into the reframing – or lack thereof – of both Afrikaans and English print newspaper reports published on the isiZulu Internet news portal *Izindaba News24*, which also belongs to Media24. Further research could entail developing a model according to which this type of reframing can be done, or could determine whether existing models in Translation Studies could be applied. Compare here the use of Nord's looping model by Van Rooyen (2011) and Van Rooyen and Naudé (2009).

## References

Average issue readership of newspapers and magazines-profile. 2009. Available online: <http://www.saarf.co.za/AMPS/technicalreport-2009A/data%20files/Amps/Tot-do1.pdf>. (Accessed 20 March 2010).

Baker, M. 2006. *Translation and conflict. A narrative account*. London: Routledge.

Baker, M. 2007. Reframing conflict in translation. *Social Semiotics* 17(2): 151-169.

Bell, A. 1991. *The language of news media*. Oxford UK and Cambridge MA: Blackwell.

Bielsa, E. and S. Bassnett. 2009. *Translation in global news*. London and New York: Routledge.

- Bruner, J. 1991. The narrative construction of reality. *Critical Inquiry* 18(1): 1-21.
- Chen, Y. 2009. The construction of 'self' and 'other' in transediting of news texts concerning political conflicts. Unpublished paper read at 3rd IATIS Conference, July 2009: Melbourne.
- Fairclough, N. 1995. *Media discourse*. London: Arnold.
- Feinauer, I. 2008. Hijacking the source text: The power of the translator. In B. Lewandowska-Tomasczyk and M. Thelen (eds.) *Translation and meaning Part 8*. Maastricht: University Press Maastricht. pp. 219-233.
- Fisher, W.R. 1984. Narration as a human communication paradigm: The case of public moral agreement. *Communication Monographs* 51: 1-22.
- Fisher, W.R. 1985. The narrative paradigm: In the beginning. *Journal of Communication* 35(4): 74-89.
- Fisher, W.R. 1987. *Human communication as narration: Toward a philosophy of reason, value, and action*. Columbia: University of South Carolina Press.
- Fox, O. 2009. The role of translation and interpretation in the shaping of a reader's view of world events: The press and the Falklands War. Unpublished paper read at 3rd IATIS Conference, July 2009: Melbourne.
- Gambier, Y. 2006. Transformations in international news. In K. Conway and S. Bassnett. *Translation in global news*. Proceedings of the conference held at the University of Warwick, 23 June 2006. UK: University of Warwick.
- Gopinathan, G. 2006. Translation, transcreation and culture. In T. Hermans (ed.) *Translating others: Volume 1*. Manchester: St Jerome. pp. 236-256.
- History and Development, 2010. *Naspers Company History*. Available online: [http://www.naspers.com/Company\\_History.cfm?content=2651&intParentContentid](http://www.naspers.com/Company_History.cfm?content=2651&intParentContentid). (Accessed 21 February 2010).
- Johnson, S. and A. Ensslin. 2007. *Language in the media: Representation, identities, ideologies*. London: Continuum.
- Kang, J-H. 2007. Recontextualization of news discourse: A case study of translation of news discourse on North Korea. In S. Cunico and J. Munday (eds.) *Translation and ideology: Encounters and clashes* 13:2. Amsterdam: John Benjamins. pp. 219-242.
- Lefevere, A. 1992. *Translation, rewriting and the manipulation of literary fame*. New York: Routledge.
- Medioclubsouthafrica, 2011. *The press in South Africa* Available online: [http://www.medioclubsouthafrica.com/index.php?option=com\\_content&view=article&id=73%3Apress&catid=36%3Amedia\\_bg&Itemid=54](http://www.medioclubsouthafrica.com/index.php?option=com_content&view=article&id=73%3Apress&catid=36%3Amedia_bg&Itemid=54). (Accessed 22 May 2011).
- Momberg, J. 2010. Personal e-mail correspondence with News24 editor-in-chief. 8 April 2010.

Oldewage, H. 2011. Personal e-mail correspondence with *Nuus24* editor-in-chief. 20 May 2011.

Somers, M.R. and G.D. Gibson. 1994. Reclaiming the epistemological “Other”: Narrative and the social constitution of identity. In C. Calhoun (ed.) *Social theory and the politics of identity*. Oxford UK and Cambridge MA: Blackwell. pp. 37-99.

Steyn, M. 2001. *Whiteness just isn't what it used to be: White identity in a changing South Africa*. New York: University of New York Press.

Tymoczko, M. 2007. *Enlarging translation. Empowering translators*. Manchester: St Jerome Publishing.

Van Rooyen, M. and J.A. Naudé. 2009. A model for the translation of news agency texts (Sapa) for radio (OFM) news. *Communicatio* 35(2): 251-275.

Van Rooyen, M. 2011. A mediation model for the translation of radio news texts in a multicultural newsroom. *Southern African Linguistics and Applied Language Studies* 29(1): 17-29.